

## **Bibliography of Articles on Multi Source Feedback (2011)**

Definition: Multi source feedback (MSF) or 360 degree feedback is the process by which multiple individuals, representing discrete informant groups, provide anonymous feedback to recipients. In medicine, the informant groups may include peer, referring physician, referral physicians, patients, co-workers (e.g., nurses, pharmacists, physical therapists) and self.

For the purpose of this bibliography\*, we have included the literature in which there are two or more sources (excluding self).

### **Medical Students**

- Tyler KM, Peer-level multiple source feedback for fitness to practice, Medical Educ 2006, 40:459-489

### **Residents**

#### **Canadian**

- Johnson D, Cujec B. Comparison of self, nurse, and physician assessment of residents rotating through an intensive care unit. Crit Care Med 1998; 26:1811-6.

#### **International**

- Allerup P, Aspergren K, Ejlersen E, Jorgensen G, Malchow-Moller A, Moller MK, Pedersen KK, Rasmussen OB, Rohold A, Sorensen B, use of 360-degree assessment of residents in internal medicine in a Danish setting: a feasibility study, Medical Teacher 2007; 29:166-170

#### **United Kingdom**

- Archer J, Norcini J, Southgate L, Heard S, Davies H, mini-PAT (Peer Assessment Tool): A valid component of a national assessment program in the UK? Adv in Health Sci Education 2006, DOI 10.1007/s10459-9033-3
- Archer J, Norcini J, Davies HA, Peer review of paediatricians in training using SPRAT, BMJ 2005; 330: 1251-1253.
- Bullock Ad, Hassell A, Markham WA, Wall DW, Whitehouse AB, How ratings vary by staff group in multi-source feedback assessment of junior doctors, Med Educ 2009, 43(6): 516-20
- Davies H, Archer J, Southgate L, Norcini J, Initial evaluation of the first year of the Foundation Assessment Program, Medical Education 2009; 43:74-81
- Carr S, The Foundation Programme assessment tools: an opportunity to enhance feedback to trainees? Postgrad Med J, 2006; 82(971):576-9
- Cohen SN, Farant PB, Taibje SM, Assessing the assessments: UK dermatology trainees' views of the workplace assessment tools, Br J Dermatol 2009; 161(1):34-39
- Davies H, Archer J, Bateman A, Dewar S, Crossley J, Grant J, Southgate L., Specialty-specific multi-source feedback: assuring validity, informing training. Medical Education 2008 ;42(10):1014-20

- Davies H A and Archer J C, Multi source feedback using Sheffield Peer Review Assessment Tool (SPRAT) - development and practical aspects. *Clinical Teacher* 2005; 2(2): 77-81.
- Hesketh EA, Anderson F, Bagnall GM, Driver CP, Johnston DA, Marshall D, et al. Using a 360 degrees diagnostic screening tool to provide an evidence trail of junior doctor performance throughout their first postgraduate year. *Med Teach* 2005;27(3):219-33.
- Murphy D, Bruce D, Mercer S, Eva K, The reliability of workplace-based assessment in postgraduate medical education and training: a national evaluation in general practice in the United Kingdom. *Adv in Health Sci Education* 2008, DOI 10.1007/s10459-008-9104-8
- Sargeant J, McNaughton E, Mercer S, Murphy D, Sullivan P, Bruce D. Providing feedback: Exploring a model (Emotion, Content, Outcomes) for facilitating multisource feedback, *Medical Teacher*, In Press.
- Stark R, Korenstein D, Karani R, Impact of a 360-degree professionalism assessment on faculty comfort and skills in feedback delivery, *J General Internal Medicine* 2008; 23(7): 969-972
- Whitehouse A, Hassell A, Wood L, Wall D, Walzman M, Campbell I. Development and reliability testing of TAB a form for 360 degrees assessment of Senior House Officers' professional behaviour, as specified by the General Medical Council. *Med Teach* 2005;27(3):252-8
- Whitehouse A, Hassell A, Bullock A, Wood L, Wall D, 360 degree assessment (multisource feedback) of UK trainee doctors: Field testing of team assessment of behaviors, *Med Teacher* 2007; 29:171-176
- Wilkinson JR, Crossley JGM, Wragg A, Mills P, Cowan G, Wade W, Implementing workplace-based assessment across the medical specialties in the United Kingdom, *Medical Education* 2008; 42:364-373

### United States

- Davis JD, Comparisons of faculty, peer, self and nurse assessment of obstetrics and gynecology residents, *Obstetrics gyn* 2002; 99(4):647-651
- Higgins RS, Bridges J, Burke JM, O'Donnell MA, Cohen NM, Wilkes SB, Implementing the ACGME general competencies in a cardiothoracic surgery residency program using 360-degree feedback. *Ann Thorac Surg* 2004; 77(1):12-7
- Joshi R, Ling FW, Jaeger J, Assessment of a 360-Degree Instrument to Evaluate Residents' Competency in Interpersonal and Communication Skills, *Acad Med* 2004 79: 458-463.
- Mazor KM, Canavan C, Farrell M, Margolis MJ, Clauser BE, Collecting validity evidence for an assessment of professionalism: Findings from think-aloud interviews, *Acad Med* 2008; 83 (10S): S9-12)
- Musick DW, McDowell SM, Clark N, Salcido R, Pilot study of a 360-degree assessment instrument for physical medicine and rehabilitation residency programs. *Am J Phys Med Rehab* 2003; 82(9):394 – 402
- Reisdorff EJ, Hughes MJ, Castaneda C, Carlson DJ, Donohue WA, Fediuk TA, Hughes WP, Developing a valid evaluation for interpersonal and communication skills, *Acad Emergency Medicine* 2006; 13(10):1056-61
- Risucci DA, Tortolani AJ, Ward RJ, Ratings of surgical residents by self, supervisors and peers. *Surg Gyn Obs* 1989; 169(6):519-526
- Wood J, Collins J, Burnside E, Albanese MA, Propeck PA, Kelcz F, Spilide JM, Schmaltz, Patient, faculty, and self-assessment of radiology performance: A 360-degree

method of measuring professionalism and interpersonal/communication skills, *Acad Radiol* 2004; 11:931-939.

- Wooliscroft JO, Howell JD, Patel BP. Resident-patient interactions: the humanistic qualities of internal medicine residents assessed by patients, attending physicians, program supervisors and nurses. *Acad Med* 1993; 68: 680-7.

### **Practicing Physicians**

#### **Canadian**

- Etherington J, Innes G, Christenson J et al., Development, implementation and reliability assessment of an emergency physician performance evaluation tool. *Can J Emerg Med* 2000; 2:237-42
- Fidler H, Lockyer J, Toews J, and Violato C, Changing Physicians' Practices: The Effect of Individual Feedback, *Academic Medicine*, 1999; 74: 702-714.
- Hall W, Violato C, Lewkonja, R, Lockyer J, Fidler H, Toews J, Jennett P, Donoff M, Moores D, Assessment of physician performance in Alberta: the Physician Achievement Review Project, *Canadian Medical Association Journal*, 1999; 161:52-57.
- Lockyer J, Violato C, Fidler H, Likelihood of Change: A study assessing surgeon use of multi source feedback data. *Teaching and Learning in Medicine*, 2003; 15: 168-174.
- Lockyer J, Multi source feedback in the assessment of physician competencies. *Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions*, 2003; 23(1): 23: 4-12.
- Lockyer J, Violato C, A multisource feedback program for anesthesiologists, *Can J of Anesthesia* *Can J of Anesthesia*, 2006, 53:33-39
- Lockyer J, Blackmore D, Fidler H, Crutcher R, Salte B, Shaw K, Ward B, Wolfish N, A study of a multi source feedback system for international medical graduates holding defined licenses, *Medical Education* 2006; 40: 340-347.
- Lockyer JM, Violato C, Fidler H, The assessment of emergency physicians by a regulatory authority. *Academic Emergency Medicine*, 2006. 13(12):1296-303
- Lockyer J, Violato C, Fidler H, What multi source feedback factors influence physician self assessments? A five year longitudinal study, *Acad Med* 2007, 82(10S): 77 – 80
- Lockyer J, Violato C, Fidler H, The assessment of radiologists through a multi source feedback tool, *Radiology* 2008, 247: 771-778.
- Lockyer J, Violato C, Fidler H, Alakija P, The assessment of pathologists/laboratory-medicine physicians through a multi source feedback tool, *Archives of Pathology and Laboratory Medicine* 2009; 133: (8): 1301-1308
- Lockyer JM, Violato C, Wright B, Fidler HM, An analysis of long term outcomes of the impact of curriculum: A comparison of the 3 and 4 year medical school curricula, *Acad Med*, 2009, 84(10): 1342-1347
- Sargeant JM, Mann KV, Ferrier SN, Langille DB, Muirhead PD, Sinclair DE. Responses of rural family physicians and their colleagues and coworker raters to a multi-source feedback process: a pilot study. *Academic Medicine*, 2003; 78 (S10): S42-S44.
- Sargeant J, Mann K, Ferrier S. Understanding family physicians reactions to MSF performance assessment: perceptions of credibility and usefulness. *Med Educ*, 2005. 39:497-504
- Sargeant J, Mann K, Sinclair D, Ferrier S, Muirhead P, van der Vleuten C, Metsmakers J Learning in practice: Experiences and perceptions of high scoring physicians, *Acad Med* 2006, 81(7):655-660

- Sargeant J, Mann K, Sinclair D, van der Vleuten C, Metsemakers J, Understanding the influence of emotions and reflection upon multi-source feedback acceptance and use, *Adv in Health Sci Educ* 2006, 10.1007/s10459-006-9039-x
- Sargeant J, Mann K, Sinclair D, van der Vleuten C, Metsemakers J, Challenges in multi source feedback: Intended and unintended consequences, *Medical Education* 2007, 41(6):581-596
- Sargeant J, Mann K, van der Vleuten C, Metsemakers J. Reflection: A link between receiving and using assessment feedback. AHSE, 2008; DOI 10.1007/s10459-008-9124-4.
- Sargeant J, Mann K, van der Vleuten C, Metsemakers J. "Directed" Self-Assessment: Practice and feedback within a social context. *Journal of Continuing Education in the Health Professions*, 28(1):47-54, 2008
- Sargeant J, MacLeod M, Sinclair D, Power M. How do physicians assess their family physician colleagues' performance? Creating a rubric to inform assessment and feedback. *J Cont Educ Health Prof*, In press.
- Violato C, Marini A, Toews J, Lockyer J, and Fidler H, Feasibility and Psychometric Properties of Using Peers, Consulting Physicians, Co-workers, and Patients to Assess Physicians, *Academic Medicine*, 1997 (supplement); 72 S82-S84.
- Violato, C, Lockyer, JM, Fidler H, Multi source feedback: A method of assessing surgical practice, *British Medical Journal*, 2003; 326: 546-548.
- Violato C, Lockyer J, Fidler H, The assessment of pediatricians by a regulatory authority, *Pediatrics* 2006; 2006, 117: 796 - 802
- Violato C, Lockyer J, Self and peer assessment of pediatricians, psychiatrists and medicine specialists: Implications for self-directed learning, *Adv in Health Sciences Educ* 2006, 11:235-244
- Violato C, Lockyer J, Fidler H, The assessment of psychiatrists in practice through multi source feedback, *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry* 2008, 53(8):525-533.
- Violato C, Lockyer J, Fidler H, Changes in performance: a 5-year longitudinal study of participants in a multi-source feedback programme, *Medical Education* 2008; 42:1007-1013

#### International

- Malling B, Mortenson L, Bonderup T, Scherpbier A, Ringsted C, Combining a leadership course and multi-source feedback has no effect on leadership skills of leaders in postgraduate medical education. An intervention study with a control group. *BMC Med Educ* 2009; 9:72
- Malling B, Bonderup T, Mortensen L, Ringsted C, Scherpbier A, Effects of multi-source feedback on developmental plans for leaders of postgraduate medical education, *Med Educ* 2009; 43(2): 159-167
- Overeem K, Wollersheim H, Driessen E, Lombarts K, van de Ven G, Grol R, Arah O, Doctor's perceptions of why 360-degree feedback does (not) work: a qualitative study: *Med Educ* 2009; 43(9): 874-882
- Overeem K, Driessen, EW, Onyebuchi AA, Lombarts KMJMH, Wollersheim HC, Grol RPTM. Peer mentoring in doctor performance assessment: strategies, obstacles and benefits. *Med Educ*. 2010 Feb;44(2):140-7.

#### United States

- Lipner RS, Blank LL, Leas BF, Fortna GS. The value of patient and peer ratings in recertification. *Acad Med* 2002; 77 (Suppl 10): S64-6.
- Ramsey PG, Wenrich MD, Carline JD, Inui TS, Larson EB, LoGerfo JP. Use of peer ratings to evaluate physician performance. *JAMA* 1993; 269: 1655-60.
- Weinrich MD, Carline JD, Giles LM, Ramsey PG. Ratings of the performances of practicing internists by hospital-based registered nurses. *Acad Med* 1993; 68: 680-7.

#### United Kingdom

- Bennett H, Gatrell J, Packham R, Medical appraisal: collecting evidence of performance through 360<sup>0</sup> feedback, *Clinician in management* 2004; 12(4):165-172
- Campbell JL, Richards SH, Dickens A, Greco M, Narayanan A, Brearley S, Assessing the professional performance of UK doctors: an evaluation of the utility of the General Medical Council patient and colleague questionnaires, *Qual Saf Health Care* 2008; 17:187-193
- Crossley J, McDonnell J, Cooper C, McAvoy P, Archer J, Davies H, Can a district hospital assess its doctors for re-licensure? *Medical Education* 2008; 42:359-363
- Evans R, Elwyn G, Edwards A, Review of instruments for peer assessment of physicians, *BMJ* 2004; 328: 1240-1245
- Griffin E, Sanders G, Craven D, King J, A computerized 360<sup>0</sup> feedback tool for personal and organizational development in general practice. *Health Informatics Journal* 2000; 6:71-80
- Lelliott P, Williams R, Mears A, Andiappan M, Owen H, Reading P, Coyle N, Hunter S, Questionnaires for 360-degree assessment of consultant psychiatrists: development and psychometric properties, *Br J Psychiatry* 2008; 193(2): 156-60

#### **Book Chapters and General Articles**

- Bruce D. & Sargeant J. 'Background and evidence for use of MSF' in Mohanna K., Tavabie A. (Ed) *General Practice Specialty Training: Making It Happen* (pp 125-134). London, UK: Royal College of General Practitioners, 2008.
- Lockyer J, Clyman S, Multi Source Feedback, in E Holmboe and R Hawkins (eds), *A practical guide to the assessment of clinical competence*. Mosby/Elsevier. 2008
- Wood L, Hassell A, Whitehouse A, Bullock A, Wall D, A literature review of multi-source feedback systems within and without health services, leading to 10 tips for their successful design, *Med Teach* 2006, 28(7): e185-91

#### **Reference Books & Core References from Industrial Psychology**

- Bracken DW, Timmreck CW, Church AH, *The handbook of multi source feedback: The comprehensive resource for designing and implementing MSF processes*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001
- Smither JW, London M, Reilly RR: Does performance improve following multisource feedback? A theoretical model, meta-analysis and review of empirical findings. *Personnel Psychology* 58:33-66, 2005.

- Tornow WW, London M and CCL Associates, Maximizing the value of 360-degree feedback: A process for successful individual and organizational development, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1998

### Useful Web Sites

Gray A, Lewis A, Fletcher C, Burke E, Mackay J, Kubelius E, Lindley P, 360 degree feedback: Best practice guidelines, 2007, <http://www.psychtesting.org.uk/> [go to downloads and do a search for 360 degree feedback to retrieve the pdf] [Accessed Jan 6, 2010]

College of Physicians and Surgeons of Alberta. [www.par-program.org](http://www.par-program.org)

This website provides copies of the questionnaires being used in Alberta for family physicians, surgeons, anesthesiologists, medical/pediatric/psychiatry, episodic care (e.g., emergency room, locum physicians, hospitalists), and radiologists along with back ground information about the program and the feedback report.

Foundations Program (United Kingdom for PGY1,2 trainees)

<http://www.foundationprogramme.nhs.uk/pages/foundation-doctors/key-documents>

This website provides a number of key documents. To look at the mini-PAT and the TAB (2 different MSF instruments) go to the key document 'The Foundation Learning Portfolio' pages 37 – 43. There are other useful documents as well (e.g., Direct Observation of Procedures, mini CEX) which are all required as part of the training program. The mini-PAT form is modeled on the UK competencies of 'Good Medical Practice' (similar to ACGME competencies). TAB is Team assessment of behaviors.

J. Lockyer PhD, University of Calgary  
J. Sargeant PhD, Dalhousie University

Updated: April, 2010